ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH

LETTER • OPEN ACCESS

Long-term trajectories of the C footprint of N fertilization in Mediterranean agriculture (Spain, 1860–2018)

To cite this article: Eduardo Aguilera et al 2021 Environ. Res. Lett. 16 085010

View the article online for updates and enhancements.

ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH

CrossMark

OPEN ACCESS

RECEIVED 31 March 2021

REVISED 8 July 2021

accepted for publication 26 July 2021

PUBLISHED 5 August 2021

Original content from this work may be used under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 licence.

Any further distribution of this work must maintain attribution to the author(s) and the title of the work, journal citation and DOI.



LETTER

Long-term trajectories of the C footprint of N fertilization in Mediterranean agriculture (Spain, 1860–2018)

Eduardo Aguilera^{1,*}, Alberto Sanz-Cobena¹, Juan Infante-Amate², Roberto García-Ruiz³, Jaime Vila-Traver⁴, Gloria I Guzmán⁴, Manuel González de Molina⁴, Alfredo Rodríguez^{1,5}, Pablo Piñero¹, and Luis Lassaletta¹

CEIGRAM, Universidad Politécnica de Madrid, 28040 Madrid, Spain

Department of Economic Theory and History, University of Granada. Campus de la Cartuja, s/n 18071 Granada, Spain

- University of Jaén, Center for advanced studies in olive groves and olive oils. Campus Las Lagunillas s/n, 23009 Jaén, Spain
- ⁴ Agroecosystem History Lab, Pablo de Olavide University, Carretera de Utrera Km1, 41013 Seville, Spain
- Department of Economic Analysis and Finances, Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha, 45071 Toledo, Spain
- Author to whom any correspondence should be addressed.

E-mail: eduardo.aguilera@upm.es

Keywords: greenhouse gas emissions, nitrous oxide, environmental history, Mediterranean climate, nitrogen Supplementary material for this article is available online

Abstract

Synthetic nitrogen (N) fertilization has helped boost agricultural yields, but it is also responsible for direct and indirect greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. Fertilizer-related emissions are also promoted by irrigation and manure application, which has increased with livestock industrialization. Spanish agriculture provides a paradigmatic example of high industrialization under two different climates (temperate and Mediterranean) and two contrasting water management regimes (rainfed and irrigated). In this study, we estimated the historical evolution of the C footprint of N fertilization (including all the life cycle GHG emissions related to N fertilization) in Spanish agriculture from 1860 to 2018 at the province level (50 provinces) for 122 crops, using climate-specific N_2O emission factors (EFs) adjusted to the type of water management and the N source (synthetic fertilizer, animal manure, crop residues and soil N mineralization) and considering changes in the industrial efficiency of N fertilizer production. Overall, N-related GHG emissions increased \sim 12-fold, up to 10–14 Tg CO₂e yr⁻¹ in the 2010s, with much higher growth in Mediterranean than in temperate areas. Direct N₂O EFs of N fertilizers doubled due to the expansion of irrigation, synthetic fertilizers and liquid manure, associated with livestock industrialization. Synthetic N production dominated the emissions balance (55%-60% of GHGe in the 21st century). Large energy efficiency gains of industrial fertilizer production were largely offset by the changes in the fertilizer mix. Downstream N₂O emissions associated with NH₃ volatilization and NO₃⁻ leaching increased tenfold. The yield-scaled carbon footprint of N use in Spanish agriculture increased fourfold, from 4 and 5 Mg CO_2 e Mg N^{-1} to 16-18 Mg CO₂e Mg N⁻¹. Therefore, the results reported herein indicate that increased productivity could not offset the growth in manufacture and soil emissions related to N use, suggesting that mitigation efforts should not only aim to increase N use efficiency but also consider water management, fertilizer type and fertilizer manufacture as key drivers of emissions.

1. Introduction

The use of synthetic nitrogen (N) fertilizers, associated with agricultural industrialization, has contributed to large yield increases that have made it possible to feed a growing population (Erisman *et al* 2008) and have helped achieve even larger increases in livestock production, allowing a growing share of animal-based products in the human diet (Lassaletta *et al* 2016). At the same time, there has been a concentration of livestock in some areas, leading to high manure application rates in nearby cropland (van Grinsven *et al* 2012, Le Noë *et al* 2017, Einarsson *et al* 2020). This increase in the availability of N has not only contributed to rising yields, but also N losses and N-derived environmental pollution (Lassaletta et al 2016, Sutton et al 2021), such as the emission of the greenhouse gas (GHG) nitrous oxide (N₂O) (Thompson et al 2019, Wang et al 2019). Nitrous oxide emissions are affected by pedoclimatic conditions, fertilizer type and water management, and IPCC Tier-1 approaches could be too coarse to properly estimate emissions (Thorman et al 2020). Irrigation allows intensifying N fertilizer application and has been shown to increase N2O emissions, particularly when combined with N fertilization (Trost et al 2013). For example, under semiarid Mediterranean conditions, both the type of irrigation and the type of N fertilizer have a clear influence on soil N_2O emissions (Cayuela *et al* 2017). On the other hand, irrigation and other crop management practices also affect indirect N₂O emissions through their influence on ammonia (NH3) volatilization and nitrate (NO₃⁻) leaching.

Furthermore, fertilizer-related life cycle emissions also include fertilizer manufacture and fossil fuel production, as well as transport of final and intermediate products. Synthetic fertilizer production is an energy- and GHG emission-intensive industrial process. The GHG emission intensity of global synthetic N fertilizer production has been estimated at 5.7 kg $CO_2 e kg^{-1} N$ (Kool *et al* 2012), which amounts to 0.6 Pg (10¹⁸ grams) CO₂e, or 1.2% of 49 Pg CO₂e global anthropogenic GHG emissions in 2010 (IPCC 2013), using 2010 consumption data from FAOSTAT (FAO 2018). Indeed, N fertilizer production usually accounts for a large share of total life cycle emissions in modern agricultural systems (Parton et al 2015, Garnier et al 2019). The role of fertilizer production in fertilizer-related GHG emissions may be even more important in the GHG emission balance of Mediterranean cropping systems (Sanz-Cobena et al 2017), particularly under rainfed conditions, where field N₂O emissions are relatively low (Cayuela et al 2017).

From a historical perspective, the changes in yields interact with the changes in N inputs and emission factors (EFs), driven by management changes, potentially resulting in changes in yield-scaled N₂O emissions. On the other hand, the energy efficiency of most industrial processes dramatically increased during the 20th century due to technological advances and scale economies, which is specifically the case of N fertilizers (Smil 2004, Ramírez and Worrell 2006). To our knowledge, the influence of these historical processes on GHG emissions has not been studied in any Mediterranean or semiarid area. Spain presents mostly a Mediterranean but also a temperate climate, contrasting irrigated and rainfed management and important historical changes in the synthetic and organic fertilization mix (Lassaletta et al 2014b, Guzmán et al 2018).

In this study we aimed to evaluate the effect of these contrasting long-term trends in farming and industry on the agro-environmental implications of N fertilization, particularly on the carbon (C) footprint. To do so, we estimated historical changes in the impact of N fertilization on GHG emissions in Spanish cropland in the long term (1860–2018).

2. Summary of methods

2.1. Scope and system boundaries

GHG emissions associated with N management in Spanish cropland were investigated for the period 1860-2018 from a life cycle assessment perspective. The analysis was performed at the crop (122 crop types) and province (50 provinces) levels, and it includes changes in agricultural N fluxes, industrial efficiency of N fertilizer production and direct and indirect soil N₂O emissions affected by soil, climate, irrigation and fertilizer type. Spanish provinces approximately correspond to the Eurostat NUTS3 classification (table S1 (available online stacks.iop.org/ERL/16/085010/mmedia)). The at provinces were classified as temperate or Mediterranean (figure S1), following the G200 classification (Olson and Dinerstein 2002) (figure S2). The functional units are 1 ha of cultivated land (including fallow) and 1 Mg N produced, thus covering 'from cradle to farm gate'. The analysis includes (a) direct N_2O emissions from the N sources included in the IPCC guidelines (IPCC 2006, 2019), comprising synthetic fertilizers, manure, urban residues, crop residues and roots, weed residues and roots, and net soil organic matter (SOM) mineralization, (b) upstream GHG emissions from the production of industrial fertilizers and (c) indirect (downstream) N₂O emissions from ammonia and nitrate exported from cropland to other ecosystems (figure 1). In the following sections, we describe the main procedures and assumptions. Further details are provided in the supplementary materials.

2.2. Activity data

To calculate N fertilizer-related GHG emissions, activity data regarding all N sources are required. These data include crop residues, which are derived from crop area and production, weed production, fertilizer consumption, manure, which is derived from livestock numbers and intake, and net mineralization of SOM. Crop area and production data at the province level (gathering data for all Spanish provinces), differentiating rainfed and irrigated land, was mainly based on data from the Spanish Yearbook of Agriculture (MAPA 2020) for ca 1890–2018 and from secondary sources and other official records for ca 1860–1890 (table S2). Weed production was estimated in two steps. First, potential weed production was



estimated at the province level based on annual water inputs (sum of precipitation and irrigation), using the NCEAS model (Del Grosso *et al* 2008). Second, the estimated potential weed production was modulated to account for the impact of management practices, including tillage and herbicide application, based on historical data in Soto *et al* (2016) and Aguilera *et al* (2018).

We reconstructed the total consumption of industrial N fertilizers in Spain on an annual basis, including synthetic fertilizers, ammonium sulfate from coke-oven gas, saltpeter and guano, mainly based on González de Molina et al (2020). Livestock N excretion, N losses during manure management and manure application rates to cropland were estimated by a balance approach including animal N ingestion and retention, as described in Aguilera et al (2018). The livestock population for nine species was downscaled to the province level based on their provincial distribution in 13 benchmark years from 1865 to 2016, interpolating the provincial shares and scaling to the total livestock population in the years with no data. Nitrogen from urban sources (municipal solid waste and sewage sludge) were gathered from MAPA (2019) in the 1990–2015 period, and estimated based on population in the remaining years. All N inputs in years outside the 1990-2015 period were allocated to each crop-irrigation-province category based on historical sources (table S3). The N applied to soils in the form of crop and weed residues, as well as the harvested N, was based on a full reconstruction of the net primary productivity and residue destinies (Guzmán et al 2014, Soto et al 2016, Aguilera et al 2018), and expressed in terms of N using N content coefficients for products (Lassaletta et al 2014a), roots (IPCC 2019) and residues (table S4). Nitrogen input to the soil from net mineralization of SOM, as well as net N sequestration in SOM, were based on the soil organic carbon (SOC) balance, following IPCC (2019) guidelines, which recommend assuming a C:N ratio in the SOM of 15 for forest and

grassland and ten for cropland. The SOC balance was calculated with the HSOC model (Aguilera *et al* 2018), a dynamic SOC model that considers the effect of soil properties, monthly climate parameters, C inputs and soil cover, and is thus sensitive to changes in climate, land use, crop distribution and crop management.

2.3. Estimation of GHG emissions

All estimated GHG emissions were converted to CO_2e using global warming potential (GWP) values with climate feedback reported in the AR5 report of the IPCC (2013), i.e. 34 for CH₄ and 298 for N₂O.

Direct soil N₂O emissions were estimated by multiplying fertilizer inputs *F* by climate-specific EFs considering the type of water management and the types of fertilizer applied (equation (1)). The combination of both types of categorization (fertilizers, *f*, and irrigation, *i*) in each climate type (*c*) was made by transforming the fertilizer-specific EFs into modifying factors (MFs) (table 1, equation (2))

$$N_2O_{\text{Direct}} - N_{c,i,f} = F_{c,i,f} \cdot EF_{c,i,f}.$$
 (1)

$$\mathrm{EF}_{c,i,f} = \mathrm{EF}_{c,i} \cdot \mathrm{MF}_{f}.$$
 (2)

The EF_{*ci*} in temperate areas were taken from the 2019 revision of the 2006 IPCC guidelines (IPCC 2019), and in Mediterranean areas they were taken from a global meta-analysis of empirical studies under Mediterranean climate conditions (Cayuela *et al* 2017). The MFs in temperate areas were derived from IPCC (2019), and in Mediterranean areas from Cayuela *et al* (2017) and IPCC (2019) (table 1). The calculation of MFs from the data in Cayuela *et al* (2017) was made by deriving the fertilizer-specific EFs reported in this source by the average EF in all Mediterranean areas (0.5%). The use of fertilizer-specific MFs resulted in lower EFs for organic solid fertilizers and crop residues and higher EFs for organic liquid fertilizers than for synthetic fertilizers, which is in accordance

Climate type	Water management	Fertilizer type	EF_{ci} (%)	MF_f	$\mathrm{EF}_{cif}\left(\% ight)$	MF source
Mediterranean	Rainfed	Synthetic	0.27	1.00	0.27	Cayuela <i>et al</i> (2017)
Mediterranean	Rainfed	Organic solid, recycling and SOM	0.27	0.38	0.10	Cayuela <i>et al</i> (2017)
Mediterranean	Rainfed	Organic liquid	0.27	1.70	0.46	Cayuela et al (2017)
Mediterranean	Rainfed	Excreta, cattle and monogastric	0.27	0.20	0.05	IPCC (2019), dry areas
Mediterranean	Rainfed	Excreta, other	0.27	0.30	0.08	IPCC (2019), dry areas
Mediterranean	Drip	Synthetic	0.51	1.00	0.51	Cayuela et al (2017)
Mediterranean	Drip	Organic solid, recycling and SOM	0.51	0.38	0.19	Cayuela <i>et al</i> (2017)
Mediterranean	Drip	Organic liquid	0.51	1.70	0.87	Cayuela et al (2017)
Mediterranean	Drip	Excreta, cattle and monogastric	0.51	0.20	0.10	IPCC (2019), dry areas
Mediterranean	Drip	Excreta, other	0.51	0.30	0.15	IPCC (2019), dry areas
Mediterranean	Sprinkler	Synthetic	0.91	1.00	0.91	Cayuela et al (2017)
Mediterranean	Sprinkler	Organic solid, recycling and SOM	0.91	0.38	0.35	Cayuela <i>et al</i> (2017)
Mediterranean	Sprinkler	Organic liquid	0.91	1.70	1.55	Cayuela <i>et al</i> (2017)
Mediterranean	Sprinkler	Excreta, cattle and monogastric	0.91	0.20	0.18	IPCC (2019), dry areas
Mediterranean	Sprinkler	Excreta, other	0.91	0.30	0.27	IPCC (2019), dry areas
Mediterranean	Furrow	Synthetic	0.47	1.00	0.47	Cayuela et al (2017)
Mediterranean	Furrow	Organic solid, recycling and SOM	0.47	0.38	0.18	Cayuela et al (2017)
Mediterranean	Furrow	Organic liquid	0.47	1.70	0.80	Cayuela et al (2017)
Mediterranean	Furrow	Excreta, cattle and monogastric	0.47	0.20	0.09	IPCC (2019), dry areas
Mediterranean	Furrow	Excreta, other	0.47	0.30	0.14	IPCC (2019), dry areas
Mediterranean	Flood	All	0.19		0.19	Not used
Temperate	All non-flood	Synthetic	1.00	1.60	1.60	IPCC (2019) wet areas
Temperate	All non-flood	All organic, recycling and SOM	1.00	0.60	0.60	IPCC (2019) wet areas
Temperate	All non-flood	Excreta, cattle and monogastric	1.00	0.60	0.60	IPCC (2019) wet areas
Temperate	All non-flood	Excreta, other	1.00	0.30	0.30	IPCC (2019) wet areas
Temperate	Flood	All	0.40	_	0.40	Not used

	Table	1. MFs	for	direct	N_2O	EFs.
--	-------	--------	-----	--------	--------	------

with the results of a global meta-analysis of organic fertilizers (Charles *et al* 2017).

Emissions associated with the production of industrial fertilizers were estimated accounting for the impacts along the full production chain of the inputs. The emission coefficients were based mainly on the embodied energy data compiled by Aguilera *et al* (2015c) converted into GHG emissions using typical values of GHG emissions from fuel combustion and primary energy in Aguilera *et al* (2019a), which include CH_4 emissions in fossil fuel production and transport. We have also included N₂O emissions from nitric acid (HNO₃) production, based on IFA (2009) and Zhang *et al* (2013). This way, the total GHG emissions of each type of industrial fertilizer *s* in a given year *t* is given by multiplying the amount of fertilizer applied *F* by the CO₂, N₂O and CH₄ EFs (expressed as CO₂e) involved in its production and transport (equation (3)). The disaggregated EFs are shown in tables S5–S8

$$CO_2 e_{s,t}^{Upstream} = F_{s,t} \cdot \left(EF_{s,t}^{CO_2} + EF_{s,t}^{N_2O} \cdot GWP_{N_2O} + EF_{s,t}^{CH_4} \cdot GWP_{CH_4} \right).$$
(3)

Ammonia volatilization was estimated using the MANNER model (Misselbrook et al 2004, Sanz-Cobena et al 2014), which considers the type of fertilizer, both manures and synthetic, the application method and timing, as well as the soil pH and weather variables highly affecting N volatilization such as rainfall, temperature and wind conditions. NO₃⁻ leaching was estimated considering the soil water balance and the N surplus, which was calculated by subtracting N outputs (crop product and residue harvest, and net N sequestration in SOM) from external (synthetic and organic fertilizers and biological N fixation) and intra-cycle N inputs (net N mineralization). The shares of this N surplus that were denitrified or leached were calculated based on soil properties and specific drainage rates, following Meisinger and Randall (1991). The estimated NH₃–N and NO₃⁻–N quantities were multiplied by specific EFs to obtain indirect N_2O emissions (equation (4))

$$N_2 O_{\text{Indirect}} - N_{c,i,f} = \left(NO_3^{-} - N_{c,i,f} \cdot EF_{NO_3^{-}} \right) \\ + \left(NH_3 - N_{c,i,f} \cdot EF_{c,i} \right). \quad (4)$$

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Soil N inputs and direct nitrous oxide emissions

Nitrogen inputs in Spanish cropland were dominated by internal N recycling from crop and weed residues and roots (also including biological N fixation) until the mid-20th century, when synthetic N fertilizers became dominant (figures 2(a) and b)). Direct excreta by grazing animals and manure application accounted for nearly one-quarter of N inputs during most of the period studied, with lower shares during the 2nd half of the 20th century due to the dominance of synthetic fertilizers and net SOM mineralization (figure S3) in that period. Direct soil N2O emissions increased five- to six-fold from the 19th century to the 21st century, with synthetic fertilizers accounting for more than one-half of total emissions since ca 1960 (figure 2(c)). By contrast, as shown in figure S4, growth was much lower when estimated with the reference Tier 1 EF (IPCC 2006), particularly in Mediterranean areas, due to the higher estimated N2O emissions in the 19th century with the reference Tier 1 EF. This underlines the importance of using climate and management-specific EFs for the estimation of soil N₂O emissions.

This growth in N_2O emissions associated with industrialization is comparable to the values estimated for France by Garnier *et al* (2019), but larger than the estimations for the Great Plains of the United States of America by Parton et al (2015), probably due to a lower contribution of SOM mineralization during preindustrial periods in Spain, where the relative cropland expansion over grassland or natural areas was lower than in the Great Plains. The growth in crop productivity expressed in terms of N extraction, approximately three- to four-fold (figure 2(d)), was lower than the growth in soil N₂O emissions (figure 2(e)), leading to a 10%-118% increase in yield-scaled emissions between preindustrial periods and the 21st century (figure 2(f)). This increase in vield-scaled emissions was not observed in temperate areas. The analysis of the shares accounted for by each climate-irrigation type shows a minor contribution of temperate and irrigated Mediterranean categories to cropland area (figure 2(g)), but these categories reached more than half of total N inputs (figure 2(h)) as a result of higher N rates, and up to 75% of total N₂O emissions (figure 2(i)) due to the additional contribution of higher EFs (figure 3). The continued growth in yield-scaled N₂O emissions in Mediterranean irrigated systems could be partially explained by the specialization on low-N crops, such as fruit orchards and horticultural crops, which resulted in a decrease in N yield in the 21st century (figure 2(d)).

The estimated average direct N₂O EF in Spain doubled during the period studied, from 0.18% to 0.36% N₂O–N N applied⁻¹ (figure 3), which is still lower than the reference IPCC Tier-1 value (1%) (IPCC 2006) and than the revised EF for dry areas (0.5%) (IPCC 2019). By input category, the only input in which significant growth of EF was observed was manure, due to the transition from solid to liquid manure management (data not shown), which resulted in a higher EF for manure as compared to synthetic fertilizers since ca 1990 (figure 3(a)). The changes in the EF were particularly pronounced in irrigated Mediterranean systems (figure 3(b)), in which they increased threefold, because the changes in N inputs were combined with changes in irrigation technologies, which have a large effect on N2O emissions (Cayuela et al 2017).

The analysis of the spatial distribution of N_2O emissions (figures 4 and S5–S9) shows major differences in area-scaled emissions between temperate areas (on the northwestern coast) and Mediterranean areas (in the rest of the country) and between preindustrial (1900) and modern (2018) agriculture. In 2018, N_2O emissions per unit area in Mediterranean areas were similar to those in temperate systems in 1900. In 1900, manure was a major component of N_2O emissions in temperate areas, but rarely surpassed one-third of emissions (figure 4(a)). In 2018, the uneven distribution of livestock specialization resulted in some provinces showing more than one-half emissions derived from manure (figure 4(b)).



considered for N_2O estimation per unit area (a); shares of inputs by input category and total N application (b); shares of direct N_2O emissions by input category and total N_2O emissions (c); crop production (including products and harvested residues) per unit area in each climate-irrigation category (d); direct N_2O emissions in each climate-irrigation category (f); and shares, by climate-irrigation category, of cropland areas (g), N inputs (h) and soil N_2O emissions (i).

The contribution of irrigated cropping systems was usually minor in 1900 (figure 4(c)), but in some provinces it surpassed one-half of emissions, particularly in the Mediterranean coastal provinces of the east of the country. In 2018, irrigated land was the main source of emissions in most Mediterranean provinces, surpassing 90% of total emissions in 4 out of 41 Mediterranean provinces (figure 4(d)). The Mediterranean provinces showing the largest areascaled emissions in 2018 were those with a large share of irrigation in combination with a large share of manure (figures 4(b) and (d)).

3.2. Fertilizer consumption and upstream GHG emissions

Industrial N fertilizer consumption (including synthetic N and N from mining sources) increased from $1-10 \text{ Gg N yr}^{-1}$ in the 19th century to 1279 Gg N yr $^{-1}$ in 2000, falling to 740 Gg N yr $^{-1}$ in 2008 but recovering to ca 1000 Gg N yr $^{-1}$ in the 2010s (figure 5(a)). Industrial N sources were first dominated by imported mined materials (guano and saltpeter) and ammonium sulfate from coke oven gas. Consumption levels started growing strongly in the 1950s, when the Spanish economy opened to the world in a context of expansion of Haber–Bosch-derived N sources. Fertilizer production GHG emissions plateaued at 9–13 Tg $CO_2 e yr^{-1}$ during the 1969–2004 period, falling to 6-8 Tg CO2e from 2005 onwards (figure 5(b)). The lack of recovery of GHG emissions in the 21st century was partially due to the decreasing trend in upstream emission intensity (figure 5(c)), with annual rates averaging 0.6%-1.6% for individual fertilizers, which was largely driven by increases in manufacturing energy efficiencies (Smil 2004, Ramírez and Worrell 2006, Aguilera et al 2015c). However, the average emission intensity of industrial fertilizers was similar in the 21st century and in the early 20th century, as 'energy-cheap' fertilizers were replaced by more energy-demanding synthetic fertilizers, which were not limited by mining deposits or coke production. Another process affecting fertilizer production GHG emissions was the contribution of CH₄ and N₂O (figure 5(d)). Fossil fuel production became a globally important source of global CH₄ emissions during the 20th century (Ghosh et al 2015), and these emissions are particularly high for natural gas (Schwietzke et al 2016). Consequently, the role of CH₄ in the C footprint of N fertilizer production grew when the use of natural gas in ammonia synthesis became generalized in the mid-20th century (peaking at 52% in 1932), and decreased afterwards due



to the decrease in CH₄ losses from fossil fuel production (Aguilera *et al* 2019a). Nitrous oxide is emitted in nitric acid production, an intermediate process of the nitrate fertilizer production process (IFA 2009), so the contribution of this gas peaked in 1960–1980 (above 30% of the total GWP), when the use of nitrate-based fertilizers was most generalized.

3.3. Sources of downstream indirect N₂O emissions Average area-based NH₃ volatilization in Span-

ish cropland increased four- to six-fold, from 1.8–2.4 kg NH₃–N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ in the 19th century to 7.5–11.1 kg NH₃–N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ in the 2010s (figure 6(a)). This increase was mostly a direct consequence of the intensive surface application of ammonium-based fertilizers (figure 5(a)) and livestock slurries, with a high concentration of NH₄⁺ (Recio et al 2018, Sanz-Cobena et al 2019), and the increasing share of urea within the synthetic fertilizer mix. Ammonia volatilization in irrigated Mediterranean areas was about one order of magnitude higher than in rainfed areas, while temperate systems showed intermediate values. These results highlight the importance of implementing effective fertilizer application strategies to abate N volatilization such as fertilizer incorporation onto the upper soil. In addition, the estimated greater emission from

irrigated Mediterranean cropping systems shows the enormous potential for NH₃ abatement if irrigation and N fertilization are managed in an integrated manner (Sanz-Cobena *et al* 2011).

Regarding area-based NO₃⁻ leaching, there was very high variability (mostly related to rainfall variability), particularly in rainfed systems, in which it ranged between zero (absence of drainage water) and 20 kg NO₃⁻-N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ in the 21st century (figure 6(b)). In spite of this variability, a strong growth trend was also identified, as leaching increased one order of magnitude from 1-3 to $10-30 \text{ kg NO}_3$ –N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹. This increase was much higher in Mediterranean areas than in temperate areas, suggesting a more pronounced impact of industrialization on water pollution under the Mediterranean climate. These trends are currently contributing to severe NO₃⁻ pollution problems in underground and surface waterbodies in many areas of Spain (Tortosa et al 2011, Arauzo and Valladolid 2013), particularly in those with a high livestock concentration (Penuelas et al 2009), underlining the need to reduce NO3⁻ leaching and promote NO3⁻ abatement by reducing N inputs, improving water management and supporting beneficial practices (Quemada et al 2013) such as agroforestry (Blanc et al 2019).



Figure 4. Spatial distribution of N_2O emissions, colored by area-based emissions (a)–(d), and showing the distribution by type of fertilizer (a), (b) and by climate-irrigation category (c), (d) in 1900 (a), (c) and 2018 (b), (d). The size of the pie charts is proportional (in a logarithmic scale) to absolute N_2O emissions in each province. The Canary Islands are not shown. See a full disclosure of province-level N_2O trends in the supplementary materials.



3.4. Total GHG emissions and C footprint

Total fertilization-related GHG emissions in Spain increased about 16-fold with industrialization, from 0.8-1.2 Tg CO₂e yr⁻¹ in the 19th century to 13.1-19.5 Tg CO₂e yr⁻¹ in the 1970–2004 period, decreasing afterwards to 10.5-14.2 Tg CO₂ yr⁻¹ (figure 7(a)). Much lower reductions in area-scaled emissions than in total emissions were observed in the 21st century (figure 7(c)) due to the decrease in rainfed Mediterranean cropland area during this period. The growth in the GWP of temperate systems was much lower than the growth in Mediterranean systems, and large differences among provinces were also observed (figures S10–S15). For example, area-based



emissions increased ca 20-fold in Mediterranean areas and ca fourfold in temperate areas. Yieldscaled emissions across Spanish cropland increased ca fourfold, from 4 and 5 Mg CO₂e Mg N⁻¹ to 16–18 Mg CO₂e Mg N⁻¹ (figure 7(d)), which indicates that the increase in yields (figure 2(d)) only partially offset the growth in emissions. Huang *et al* (2017) found that yield-scaled GHG emissions associated with fertilizer inputs in grain crop cultivation in Chinese agriculture increased from 1978 to 2012, despite the increase in yields. By contrast, yieldscaled emissions in Spain actually decreased by about one-third between 1970 and the 2010s, but this was after huge growth in the mid-20th century (ca sixfold between 1940 and 1970).

There were large differences in the contribution of the different emission types to the total GWP between temperate (figure 7(e)) and Mediterranean (figures 7(f) and (g)) systems, with highly pronounced historical changes in the latter. The contribution of upstream emissions was greater in Mediterranean systems due to the low N₂O EFs. In fact, upstream emissions accounted for more than half of all fertilizer-related emissions as early as 1920 in Mediterranean rainfed systems, surpassing 80% in most years after 1970. Specific studies of herbaceous and woody crops in Spain have shown that fertilizer production is associated with generally higher GWP than soil N₂O emissions (Aguilera *et al* 2015a, 2015b, Guardia *et al* 2016, Montoya *et al* 2021); this pattern has also been found in Mediterranean systems in Australia (Biswas *et al* 2011). This comparative study shows that the role of upstream emissions is much higher in Mediterranean than in temperate systems (figure 7). Today direct and downstream emissions, although this share is increasing.

3.5. Limitations of the assessment

Nitrate leaching to waterbodies contributes to the increase in their degree of eutrophication, which is a major driver of waterbody CH₄ emissions (Deemer et al 2016, IPCC 2019). Methane emissions from irrigation-related waterbodies in Spain has been estimated to be 2.7 Tg CO₂e yr⁻¹ in 2008 (Aguilera *et al* 2019b), which is similar to the 2.6 Tg $CO_2 e yr^{-1}$ direct soil N₂O emissions estimated in this study. Therefore, considering these indirect effects of NO₃⁻ leaching on waterbody CH4 emissions could potentially lead to much higher fertilizer-related GHG emissions. Another limitation of the methodology relates to the assumption that no reactive N from the surplus is retained in the soil from year to year, given that all surplus N (excluding NH₃ volatilization and N incorporation to SOM) was assumed to be either denitrified or leached. However, despite there is evidence that some of the NO_3^- can be adsorbed to soil particles or retained in the microbial biomass, this retention is generally low and shortterm (Abdelwaheb et al 2019). Also, the relationship between N fertilization and soil C sequestration was not analyzed in the study. Nitrogen fertilizers have been related to enhanced soil C sequestration (Xu et al 2021), although there is a controversy on this issue (Khan et al 2007). This trend has also been observed in Mediterranean cropping systems, in which soil C was lower in nonfertilized plots than in fertilized plots (Aguilera et al 2013). In the case of indirect N_2O from volatilized NH3, it should be noted that historical information regarding fertilizer incorporation was not included, although the share of fertilizers being incorporated could be assumed to be low. These processes should be studied in future research.

3.6. Policy implications

The current reform of the European Union (EU) Common Agricultural Policy offers the opportunity to adapt actions to regional conditions. The results of this study clearly support the notion that only specific assessments tailored to the regional scale can effectively respond to the current challenges, as recently suggested by Lassaletta *et al* (2021). Thus, a transition from Tier-1 to Tier-3 approaches to estimate N₂O emissions is strongly recommended in all countries (Thompson *et al* 2019). The present Tier-2 estimation



of N_2O emissions is an important step in this direction. Successful implementation of the recent EU Farm to Fork Strategy (European Commission 2020) aiming to reduce fertilization 20% and N losses 50% by 2030, should also be sustained on crop-specific and regionally adapted assessments. The present study provides a detailed assessment of fertilizer-related emissions in Spain that distinguishes emission hotspots in each province, thus helping design effective mitigation policies.

4. Conclusions

The long-term approach starting at 1860, thus covering a century more than most global statistical data sets, e.g. FAOSTAT (FAO 2021), in combination with detailed subnational analysis differentiating climate and irrigation types, made it possible to identify significant growth and structural changes before 1960, which cannot be done easily using global approaches. For example, synthetic fertilizers production already played an important role in total fertilizer-related GHG emissions in the early 20th century and has completely dominated the emission balance since the mid-20th century. This analysis also shows that historical changes in N2O emissions in Mediterranean systems were much more pronounced than in temperate systems, mainly due to the expansion of irrigation and industrial livestock production, which were associated with larger increases in N inputs and EFs. The major role of upstream emissions from fertilizer production, particularly in rainfed Mediterranean systems and in the late 20th century, was driven by low soil N2O EFs in these systems as well as the contribution of N₂O and CH₄ in the fertilizer life cycle. We conclude that the development of efficient mitigation strategies to reduce GHG emissions associated with fertilization has to focus on emission hotspots such

as the ones identified in our study, and be based on assessments considering: (a) specific EFs adapted to regional agro-environmental conditions, (b) a full C footprint evaluation including upstream and downstream emissions.

Data availability statement

The data that support the findings of this study are available upon reasonable request from the authors.

Acknowledgments

The authors are grateful to the Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness (AgroSceNA-UP, PID2019-107972RB-I00), the Instituto Nacional de Investigación y Tecnología Agraria y Alimentaria of Spain (MACSUR02-APCIN2016-0005-00-00) and the Comunidad de Madrid, Spain (AGRISOST-CM S2018/BAA-4330). E Aguilera is supported by a Juan de la Cierva research contract from the Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness (IJC2019-040699-I and FJCI-2017-34077). L Lassaletta is supported by Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness (MINECO) and European Commission ERDF Ramón y Cajal Grant (RYC-2016-20269), Programa Propio from UPM, and acknowledges the Comunidad de Madrid (Spain) and structural funds 2014-2020 (ERDF and ESF). A Sanz-Cobena gratefully acknowledges the Autonomous Community of Madrid and UPM for their economic support through the research project APOYOJOVENESNFW8ZQ-42-XE8B5K. All authors are grateful to this project for covering the publication fees. The authors are very grateful to the Spanish Ministry of Agriculture for gathering and providing detailed information with respect to crop production and management. The authors gratefully

acknowledge the two anonymous reviewers for their constructive and useful suggestions.

ORCID iDs

Eduardo Aguilera () https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4382-124X

Alberto Sanz-Cobena
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2119-5620

Juan Infante-Amate https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1446-7181

Roberto García-Ruiz () https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9277-1993

Jaime Vila-Traver in https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1991-8802

Manuel González de Molina 💿

https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0253-6971

Alfredo Rodríguez () https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7987-1623

Pablo Piñero l https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1027-944X

Luis Lassaletta line https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9428-2149

References

- Abdelwaheb M, Jebali K, Dhaouadi H and Dridi-Dhaouadi S 2019 Adsorption of nitrate, phosphate, nickel and lead on soils: risk of groundwater contamination *Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf.* **179** 182–7
- Aguilera E, Guzmán G I and Alonso A M 2015b Greenhouse gas emissions from conventional and organic cropping systems in Spain. I. Herbaceous crops *Agron. Sustain. Dev.* **35** 713–24
- Aguilera E, Guzmán G I, Alvaro-Fuentes J, Infante-Amate J, García-Ruiz R, Carranza-Gallego G, Soto D and González de Molina M 2018 A historical perspective on soil organic carbon in Mediterranean cropland (Spain, 1900–2008) *Sci. Total Environ.* **621** 634–48
- Aguilera E, Guzmán G I, González de Molina M, Soto D and Infante-Amate J 2019a From animals to machines. The impact of mechanization on the carbon footprint of traction in Spanish agriculture: 1900–2014 J. Cleaner Prod. 221 295–305
- Aguilera E, Guzmán G I, Infante-Amate J, Soto D, García-Ruiz R, Herrera A, Villa I, Torremocha E, Carranza G and González de Molina M 2015c Embodied energy in agricultural inputs incorporating a historical perspective *DT-SEHA 1507* (Sociedad Española de Historia Agraria)
- Aguilera E, Guzman G and Alonso A 2015a Greenhouse gas emissions from conventional and organic cropping systems in Spain. II. Fruit tree orchards *Agron. Sustain. Dev.* **35** 725–37
- Aguilera E, Lassaletta L, Gattinger A and Gimeno B S 2013 Managing soil carbon for climate change mitigation and adaptation in Mediterranean cropping systems. A meta-analysis *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **168** 25–36
- Aguilera E, Vila-Traver J, Deemer B R, Infante-Amate J, Guzmán G I and González de Molina M 2019b Methane emissions from artificial waterbodies dominate the carbon footprint of irrigation: a study of transitions in the food–energy–water–climate nexus (Spain, 1900–2014) *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **53** 5091–101
- Arauzo M and Valladolid M 2013 Drainage and N-leaching in alluvial soils under agricultural land uses: implications for the implementation of the EU nitrates directive Agric. Ecosyst. Environ. 179 94–107

- Biswas W K, Barton L and Carter D 2011 Biodiesel production in a semiarid environment: a life cycle assessment approach *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **45** 3069–74
- Blanc S, Gasol C M, Martinez-Blanco J, Munoz P, Coello J, Casals P, Mosso A and Brun F 2019 Economic profitability of agroforestry in nitrate vulnerable zones in Catalonia (NE Spain) Span. J. Agric. Res. 17 e0101
- Cayuela M L *et al* 2017 Direct nitrous oxide emissions in Mediterranean climate cropping systems: emission factors based on a meta-analysis of available measurement data *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **238** 25–35
- Charles A, Rochette P, Whalen J K, Angers D A, Chantigny M H and Bertrand N 2017 Global nitrous oxide emission factors from agricultural soils after addition of organic amendments: a meta-analysis *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **236** 88–98
- Deemer B R, Harrison J A, Li S, Beaulieu J J, DelSontro T, Barros N, Bezerra-Neto J F, Powers S M, Dos Santos M A and Vonk J A 2016 Greenhouse gas emissions from reservoir water surfaces: a new global synthesis *Bioscience* 66 949–64
- Del Grosso S, Parton W, Stohlgren T, Zheng D, Bachelet D, Prince S, Hibbard K and Olson R 2008 Global potential net primary production predicted from vegetation class, precipitation, and temperature *Ecology* **89** 2117–26
- Einarsson R, Pitulia D and Cederberg C 2020 Subnational nutrient budgets to monitor environmental risks in EU agriculture: calculating phosphorus budgets for 243 EU 28 regions using public data *Nutr. Cycling Agroecosyst.* **117** 199–213
- Erisman J W, Sutton M A, Galloway J, Klimont Z and Winiwarter W 2008 How a century of ammonia synthesis changed the world *Nat. Geosci.* **1** 636–9
- European Commission 2020 Farm to fork strategy. For a fair, healthy and environmentally-friendly food system
- FAO 2018 FAOSTAT inputs domain. Part of FAOSTAT—FAO database for food and agriculture ed FAO (Rome: Food and Agriculture Organisation of United Nations (FAO)) (available at: http://faostat3.fao.org/browse/R/*/E) (Accessed 15 September 2018)
- FAO 2021 FAOSTAT—FAO database for food and agriculture (Rome: Food and Agriculture Organisation of United Nations (FAO)) (available at: http://faostat3.fao.org/) (accessed 05 April 2021)
- Garnier J, Le Noë J, Marescaux A, Sanz-Cobena A, Lassaletta L, Silvestre M, Thieu V and Billen G 2019 Long-term changes in greenhouse gas emissions from French agriculture and livestock (1852–2014): from traditional agriculture to conventional intensive systems *Sci. Total Environ.* 660 1486–501
- Ghosh A et al 2015 Variations in global methane sources and sinks during 1910–2010 Atmos. Chem. Phys. 15 2595–612
- González de Molina M, Soto Fernandez D, Guzmán Casado G, Infante-Amate J, Aguilera E, Vila Traver J and García Ruiz R 2020 *The Social Metabolism of Spanish Agriculture* (Berlin: Springer)
- Guardia G, Abalos D, Garcia-Marco S, Quemada M, Alonso-Ayuso M, Cardenas L M, Dixon E R and Vallejo A 2016 Effect of cover crops on greenhouse gas emissions in an irrigated field under integrated soil fertility management *Biogeosciences* **13** 5245–57
- Guzmán G I, Aguilera E, Soto Fernández D, Cid A, Infante-Amate J, García-Ruiz R, Herrera González de Molina A, Villa Gil-Bermejo I and González de Molina M 2014 Methodology and conversion factors to estimate the net primary productivity of historical and contemporary agroecosystems Sociedad Española de Historia Agraria DT-SEHA 1407
- Guzmán G I, González de Molina M, Soto D, Infante-Amate J and Aguilera E 2018 Spanish agriculture from 1900 to 2008: a long-term perspective on agroecosystem energy *Reg. Environ. Change* 18 995–1008
- Huang X, Chen C, Qian H, Chen M, Deng A, Zhang J and Zhang W 2017 Quantification for carbon footprint of

agricultural inputs of grains cultivation in China since 1978 J. Cleaner Prod. 142 1629–37

- IFA 2009 Fertilizers, Climate Change and Enhancing Agricultural Productivity Sustainably (Paris: International Fertilizer Industry Association) p 30
- IPCC 2006 Agriculture, Forestry and Other Land Use *Guidelines* for national greenhouse gas inventories vol 4 (Japan: Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change)
- IPCC 2013 Climate change 2013: the physical science basis Contribution of Working Group I to the 5th Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- IPCC 2019 2019 refinement of the 2006 guidelines for national greenhouse gas inventories ed E Calvo Buendia, K Tanabe, A Kranjc, J Baasansuren, M Fukuda, S Ngarize, A Osako, Y Pyrozhenko, P Shermanau and S Federici (Switzerland: Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change)
- Khan S A, Mulvaney R L, Ellsworth T R and Boast C W 2007 The myth of nitrogen fertilization for soil carbon sequestration J. Environ. Qual. 36 1821–32
- Kool A, Marinussen M and Blonk H 2012 LCI data for the calculation tool Feedprint for greenhouse gas emissions of feed production and utilization GHG Emissions of N, P and K Fertilizer Production ed (Gouda: Bolk Consultants) 20
- Lassaletta L, Billen G, Garnier J, Bouwman L, Velazquez E, Mueller N D and Gerber J S 2016 Nitrogen use in the global food system: past trends and future trajectories of agronomic performance, pollution, trade, and dietary demand *Environ. Res. Lett.* **11** 095007
- Lassaletta L, Billen G, Grizzetti B, Garnier J, Leach A M and Galloway J N 2014a Food and feed trade as a driver in the global nitrogen cycle: 50 year trends *Biogeochemistry* 118 225–41
- Lassaletta L, Billen G, Romero E, Garnier J and Aguilera E 2014b How changes in diet and trade patterns have shaped the N cycle at the national scale: spain *Reg. Environ. Change* 14 785–97
- Lassaletta L, Cobena A S, Aguilera E, Quemada M, Billen G F, Bondeau A, Cayuela M, Cramer W, Eekhout J P and Garnier J 2021 Nitrogen dynamics in cropping systems under Mediterranean climate: a systemic analysis *Environ*. *Res. Lett.* **16** 073002
- Le Noë J, Billen G and Garnier J 2017 How the structure of agro-food systems shapes nitrogen, phosphorus, and carbon fluxes: the generalized representation of agro-food system applied at the regional scale in France *Sci. Total Environ.* **586** 42–55
- MAPA 2019 Balance de nitrógeno de la agricultura española. Ministerio de agricultura, pesca y alimentación
- MAPA 2020 Anuario De Estadística Agraria 1904–2018 (Madrid: Ministerio de Agricultura Pesca y Alimentación (MAPA))
- Meisinger J J and Randall G W 1991 Estimating nitrogen budgets for soil-crop systems *Managing Nitrogen for Groundwater Quality and Farm Profitability Follet R F* (Madison, WI: Soil Science Society of America) pp 85–124
- Misselbrook T H, Sutton M A and Scholefield D 2004 A simple process-based model for estimating ammonia emissions from agricultural land after fertilizer applications *Soil Use Manage.* **20** 365–72
- Montoya M, Vallejo A, Corrochano-Monsalve M, Aguilera E, Sanz-Cobena A, Ginés C, González-Murua C, Álvarez J M and Guardia G 2021 Mitigation of yield-scaled nitrous oxide emissions and global warming potential in an oilseed rape crop through N source management *J. Environ. Manage.* 288 112304
- Olson D M and Dinerstein E 2002 The global 200: priority ecoregions for global conservation *Ann. Mo. Bot. Gard.* **89** 199–224
- Parton W J, Gutmann M P, Merchant E R, Hartman M D, Adler P R, McNeal F M and Lutz S M 2015 Measuring and mitigating agricultural greenhouse gas production in the

US Great Plains, 1870–2000 *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 112 E4681–88

- Penuelas J, Sardans J, Alcaniz J M and Poch J M 2009 Increased eutrophication and nutrient imbalances in the agricultural soil of NE Catalonia, Spain *J. Environ. Biol.* **30** 841–6
- Quemada M, Baranski M, Nobel-de Lange M N J, Vallejo A and Cooper J M 2013 Meta-analysis of strategies to control nitrate leaching in irrigated agricultural systems and their effects on crop yield Agric. Ecosyst. Environ. 174 1–10
- Ramírez C A and Worrell E 2006 Feeding fossil fuels to the soil: an analysis of energy embedded and technological learning in the fertilizer industry *Resour. Conserv. Recycl.* **46** 75–93
- Recio J, Vallejo A, Le-Noë J, Garnier J, García-Marco S, Álvarez J M and Sanz-Cobena A 2018 The effect of nitrification inhibitors on NH₃ and N₂O emissions in highly N fertilized irrigated Mediterranean cropping systems *Sci. Total Environ.* 636 427–36
- Sanz-Cobena A *et al* 2014 Yield-scaled mitigation of ammonia emission from N fertilization: the Spanish case *Environ. Res. Lett.* **9** 125005
- Sanz-Cobena A et al 2017 Strategies for greenhouse gas emissions mitigation in Mediterranean agriculture: a review Agric. Ecosyst. Environ. 238 5–24
- Sanz-Cobena A, Misselbrook T H, Hernáiz P and Vallejo A 2019 Impact of rainfall to the effectiveness of pig slurry shallow injection method for NH₃ mitigation in a Mediterranean soil Atmos. Environ. 216 116913
- Sanz-Cobena A, Misselbrook T, Camp V and Vallejo A 2011 Effect of water addition and the urease inhibitor NBPT on the abatement of ammonia emission from surface applied urea *Atmos. Environ.* 45 1517–24
- Schwietzke S *et al* 2016 Upward revision of global fossil fuel methane emissions based on isotope database *Nature* **538** 88–91
- Smil V 2004 The world's greatest fix: a history of nitrogen in agriculture Nature 431 909
- Soto D, Infante-Amate J, Guzmán G I, Cid A, Aguilera E, García R and de Molina M G 2016 The social metabolism of biomass in Spain, 1900–2008: from food to feed-oriented changes in the agro-ecosystems *Ecol. Econ.* **128** 130–8
- Sutton M A, Howard C M, Kanter D R, Lassaletta L, Móring A, Raghuram N and Read N 2021 The nitrogen decade: mobilizing global action on nitrogen to 2030 and beyond *One Earth* 4 10–4
- Thompson R L *et al* 2019 Acceleration of global N₂O emissions seen from two decades of atmospheric inversion *Nat. Clim. Change* 9 993–8
- Thorman R E *et al* 2020 Towards country-specific nitrous oxide emission factors for manures applied to arable and grassland soils in the UK *Front. Sustainable Food Syst.* **4** 62
- Tortosa G, Correa D, Sanchez-Raya A J, Delgado A, Sanchez-Monedero M A and Bedmar E J 2011 Effects of nitrate contamination and seasonal variation on the denitrification and greenhouse gas production in La Rocina Stream (Donana National Park, SW Spain) *Ecol. Eng.* 37 539–48
- Trost B, Prochnow A, Drastig K, Meyer-Aurich A, Ellmer F and Baumecker M 2013 Irrigation, soil organic carbon and N₂O emissions. A review *Agron. Sustain. Dev.* **33** 733–49
- van Grinsven H J M *et al* 2012 Management, regulation and environmental impacts of nitrogen fertilization in northwestern Europe under the nitrates directive; a benchmark study *Biogeosciences* **9** 5143–60
- Wang Q et al 2019 Data-driven estimates of global nitrous oxide emissions from croplands Natl Sci. Rev. 7 441–52
- Xu C, Xu X, Ju C, Chen H Y H, Wilsey B J, Luo Y and Fan W 2021 Long-term, amplified responses of soil organic carbon to nitrogen addition worldwide *Glob. Change Biol.* 27 1170–80
- Zhang W-F *et al* 2013 New technologies reduce greenhouse gas emissions from nitrogenous fertilizer in China *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **110** 8375–80